

General Docket
United States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit

Court of Appeals Docket #: 25-13913
Nature of Suit: 3440 Other Civil Rights
Shannon Schemel, et al v. City of Marco Island Florida
Appeal From: Middle District of Florida
Fee Status: Fee Paid

Docketed: 11/06/2025

Case Type Information:

- 1) Private Civil
- 2) Federal Question
- 3) -

Originating Court Information:

District: 113A-2 : [2:22-cv-00079-KCD-DNF](#)
Court Reporter: FLMD Court Reporter TBA
Civil Proceeding: Kyle C. Dudek, U.S. District Judge
Secondary Judge: Douglas N. Frazier, U.S. Magistrate Judge
Date Filed: 02/07/2022
Date NOA Filed:
11/05/2025

Prior Cases:

None

Current Cases:

None

SHANNON SCHEMEL

Appellant

Plaintiff -

Andreia Trifo
Direct: 202-918-6903
[COR LD NTC Retained]
New Civil Liberties Alliance
4250 N FAIRFAX DR STE 300
ARLINGTON, VA 22203

John Julian Vecchione
Direct: 202-918-6902
[COR NTC Retained]
New Civil Liberties Alliance
4250 N FAIRFAX DR STE 300
ARLINGTON, VA 22203

STEPHEN OVERMAN

Appellant

Plaintiff -

Andreia Trifo
Direct: 202-918-6903
[COR LD NTC Retained]
(see above)

John Julian Vecchione
Direct: 202-918-6902
[COR NTC Retained]
(see above)

MICHAEL TSCHIDA

Appellant

Plaintiff -

Andreia Trifo
Direct: 202-918-6903
[COR LD NTC Retained]
(see above)

John Julian Vecchione
Direct: 202-918-6902
[COR NTC Retained]
(see above)

versus

CITY OF MARCO ISLAND FLORIDA

Appellee

Defendant -

Matthew H. Mandel
Direct: 954-763-4242
[COR LD NTC Retained]

Weiss Serota Helfman Cole & Bierman, PL
Firm: 305-854-0800
2800 PONCE DE LEON BLVD FL 12
CORAL GABLES, FL 33134

Anne Reilly Flanigan
Direct: 954-763-4242
[COR NTC Retained]
Weiss Serota Helfman Cole & Bierman, PL
Firm: 305-854-0800
2800 PONCE DE LEON BLVD FL 12
CORAL GABLES, FL 33134

Amanda Ann Pulido
Direct: 954-763-4242
[COR NTC Retained]
Weiss Serota Helfman Cole & Bierman, PL
Firm: 954-763-4242
200 E BROWARD BLVD STE 1900
FORT LAUDERDALE, FL 33301

Blayne Yudis
Direct: 954-763-4242
[NTC Retained]
Weiss Serota Helfman Cole & Bierman, PL
Firm: 954-763-4242
200 E BROWARD BLVD STE 1900
FORT LAUDERDALE, FL 33301

CATO INSTITUTE

Amicus Curiae

Matthew P. Cavedon
Direct: 706-309-2859
[COR LD NTC Amicus Curiae]
The Cato Institute
1000 MASSACHUSETTS AVE NW
WASHINGTON, DC 20001

SERVICE

Lawrence M. Watson
[NTC Retained]
Upchurch Watson White Max
Firm: 407-661-1123
1060 MAITLAND CTR COMMONS STE 440
MAITLAND, FL 32751

STATE OF GEORGIA

Amicus Curiae

John Henry Thompson
[COR LD NTC Government]
Georgia Department of Law
Attorney General's Office
Firm: 404-458-3488
40 CAPITOL SQUARE SW
ATLANTA, GA 30334

STATE OF ALABAMA

Amicus Curiae

John Henry Thompson
[COR LD NTC Government]
(see above)

STATE OF ALASKA

Amicus Curiae

John Henry Thompson
[COR LD NTC Government]
(see above)

STATE OF ARKANSAS

Amicus Curiae

John Henry Thompson
[COR LD NTC Government]
(see above)

STATE OF INDIANA

Amicus Curiae

John Henry Thompson
[COR LD NTC Government]
(see above)

STATE OF IOWA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF KANSAS	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF LOUISIANA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF MISSOURI	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF NEBRASKA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF OHIO	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF PENNSYLVANIA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF TENNESSEE	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF TEXAS	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF UTAH	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA	Amicus Curiae	John Henry Thompson [COR LD NTC Government] (see above)
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	Amicus Curiae	Michael Weisbuch Direct: 202-322-2450 [COR NTC U.S. Government] DOJ-Osg Firm: 202-514-2202 950 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW WASHINGTON, DC 20530-0009
FLORIDA POLICE CHIEFS ASSOCIATION	Amicus Curiae	John David Marsey Direct: 850-219-3631 [COR LD NTC Retained] Florida Police Chiefs Association

2636 MITCHAM DR STE 1050
TALLAHASSEE, FL 32308

FLORIDA SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION

Amicus Curiae

Robert Wayne Evans
Direct: 850-561-3503
[COR LD NTC Retained]
Allen Norton & Blue, PA
Firm: 850-561-3503
906 N MONROE ST STE 100
TALLAHASSEE, FL 32303

SHANNON SCHEMEL,
STEPHEN OVERMAN,
MICHAEL TSCHIDA,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

CITY OF MARCO ISLAND FLORIDA,
50 Bald Eagle Drive Relief Marco Island, FL 34145,

Defendant - Appellee,

CHIEF OF POLICE FOR THE CITY OF MARCO ISLAND,

Defendant.

11/06/2025	☐ 1 15 pg, 459.33 KB	CIVIL APPEAL DOCKETED. Notice of appeal filed by Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida on 11/05/2025. Fee Status: Fee Paid. Awaiting Appellant's Certificate of Interested Persons due on or before 11/25/2025 as to Appellant Shannon Schemel. Awaiting Appellee's Certificate of Interested Persons due on or before 12/05/2025 as to Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. [Entered: 11/07/2025 10:47 AM]
11/12/2025	☐ 2 1 pg, 461.41 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Anne Reilly Flanigan for City of Marco Island Florida. Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Anne Flanigan) [Entered: 11/12/2025 11:57 AM]
11/12/2025	☐ 3 4 pg, 270.59 KB	Certificate of Interested Persons and Corporate Disclosure Statement filed by Attorney Anne Reilly Flanigan for Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. On the same day the CIP is served, any filer represented by counsel must also complete the court's web-based stock ticker symbol certificate at the link here http://www.ca11.uscourts.gov/web-based-cip or on the court's website. See 11th Cir. R. 26.1-1(b). [25-13913] (ECF: Anne Flanigan) [Entered: 11/12/2025 02:46 PM]
11/12/2025	☐ 4 1 pg, 128.32 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Andreia Trifoi for Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 11/12/2025 04:56 PM]
11/13/2025	☐ 5 1 pg, 150.54 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Anne Reilly Flanigan for City of Marco Island Florida, Matthew H. Mandel for City of Marco Island Florida and Blayne Yudis for City of Marco Island Florida. Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: John Vecchione) [Entered: 11/13/2025 04:30 PM]
11/13/2025	☐ 6 1 pg, 150.54 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by John J. Vecchione for all Appellants.(Shannon Druen(Schemel); Stephen Overman and Michael Tschida Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: John Vecchione) [Entered: 11/13/2025 04:43 PM]
11/18/2025	☐ 7 3 pg, 267.26 KB	Civil Appeal Statement filed by Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. Related cases? Yes. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 11/18/2025 06:18 PM]
11/18/2025	☐ 8 4 pg, 121.52 KB	Certificate of Interested Persons and Corporate Disclosure Statement filed by Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. On the same day the CIP is served, any filer represented by counsel must also complete the court's web-based stock ticker symbol certificate at the link here http://www.ca11.uscourts.gov/web-based-cip or on the court's website. See 11th Cir. R. 26.1-1(b). [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 11/18/2025 06:24 PM]
11/19/2025	☐ 9 2 pg, 201.77 KB	TRANSCRIPT ORDER FORM SUBMITTED by Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. No hearings. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 11/19/2025 11:22 AM]
11/19/2025	☐ 10 2 pg, 212.3 KB	TRANSCRIPT ORDER form filed by Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Shannon Schemel, Stephen Overman and Michael Tschida. No hearings. [Entered: 11/19/2025 04:58 PM]
11/19/2025	☐ 11 2 pg, 93.32 KB	Briefing Notice issued to Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. The appellant's brief is due on or before 12/16/2025. The appendix is due no later than 7 days from the filing of the appellant's brief. [Entered: 11/19/2025 04:59 PM]
11/24/2025	☐ 12 5 pg, 277.06 KB	Returned Mail was received for Attorney Lawrence M. Watson for Not Party Service. IN RE: 11/07/2025 Civil Docketing Notice [Entered: 11/25/2025 10:47 AM]
11/25/2025	☐ 13 1 pg, 101.36 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Matthew H. Mandel for City of Marco Island Florida. Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Matthew Mandel) [Entered: 11/25/2025 11:21 AM]
11/26/2025	☐ 14 0 pg, 0 KB	Notice to Counsel of Record. Counsel of Record must be logged in to CM/ECF and Pacer to access this document. This is the only notice you will receive regarding this matter. Please print a copy for your file. [Entered: 11/26/2025 11:58 AM]
12/02/2025	☐ 15 4 pg, 472.93 KB	Returned Mail was received for Attorney Lawrence M. Watson for Not Party Service. IN RE: 11/19/25 Briefing notice [Entered: 12/05/2025 04:29 PM]
12/16/2025	☐ 16 62 pg, 371.94 KB	Appellant's brief filed by Shannon Schemel, Stephen Overman and Michael Tschida. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 12/16/2025 04:58 PM]
12/16/2025	☐ 17 60 pg, 20.59 MB	Appendix filed [1 VOLUMES] by Appellants Shannon Schemel, Stephen Overman and Michael Tschida. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 12/16/2025 05:14 PM]
12/17/2025	☐ 18	Over the phone 30-day extension granted by clerk as to Attorney Anne Reilly Flanigan for Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. Appellee's brief is now due on 02/17/2026 as to Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. <u>Any request for a second or subsequent extension of time shall be subject to 11th Cir. R. 31-2(d).</u> [Entered: 12/17/2025 10:56 AM]
12/23/2025	☐ 19 1 pg, 84.59 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Matthew P. Cavedon, Cato Institute Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Matthew Cavedon) [Entered: 12/23/2025 09:59 AM]

12/23/2025	☐ 20 26 pg, 388.75 KB	Amicus Brief as of right or by consent of the parties filed by Matthew P. Cavedon for the Cato Institute. [25-13913] (ECF: Matthew Cavedon) [Entered: 12/23/2025 10:02 AM]
01/13/2026	☐ 21	NOTICE OF CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS (CIP) DEFICIENCY issued to Matthew P. Cavedon for Cato Institute. You have failed to complete the Web-Based CIP on the Court's website. If you are an appellant or petitioner, pursuant to 11th Cir. Rules 26.1-5(c) and 42-1(b), this appeal will be dismissed without further notice upon the expiration of 14 days from the date of this notice unless you remedy the default(s). If you are an appellee or respondent, pursuant to 11th Cir. R. 26.1-5(c), no action may be taken on your filings until you comply with the CIP rules. [Entered: 01/13/2026 09:53 AM]
01/16/2026	☐ 22 1 pg, 102.35 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Amanda Pulido for City of Marco Island Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Amanda Pulido) [Entered: 01/16/2026 12:32 PM]
02/17/2026	☐ 23 30 pg, 408.77 KB	Appellee's Brief filed by Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. [25-13913] (ECF: Amanda Pulido) [Entered: 02/17/2026 11:29 PM]
02/18/2026	☐ 24	Over the phone extension granted by clerk as to Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Shannon Schemel, Stephen Overman and Michael Tschida. Updated Reply Brief. Due on 03/24/2026 as to Appellant Shannon Schemel. <u>Any request for a second or subsequent extension of time shall be subject to 11th Cir. R. 31-2(d).</u> [Entered: 02/18/2026 02:25 PM]
02/24/2026	☐ 25 1 pg, 131.52 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by John Henry Thompson for State of Georgia, AL, AK, AR, IN, IA, KS, LA, MO, NE, ND, OH, PA, SC, SD, TN, TX, UT, and WV Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: John Henry Thompson) [Entered: 02/24/2026 01:30 PM]
02/24/2026	☐ 26 46 pg, 351.59 KB	Amicus Brief as of right or by consent of the parties filed by John Henry Thompson for State of Georgia, AL, AK, AR, IN, IA, KS, LA, MO, NE, ND, OH, PA, SC, SD, TN, TX, UT, and WV. [25-13913] (ECF: John Henry Thompson) [Entered: 02/24/2026 01:36 PM]
02/24/2026	☐ 27 1 pg, 131.59 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Michael Weisbuch for Amicus Curiae U.S. Department of Justice Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Michael Weisbuch) [Entered: 02/24/2026 03:05 PM]
02/24/2026	☐ 28 25 pg, 174.08 KB	Amicus Brief as of right or by consent of the parties filed by Michael Weisbuch for Amicus Curiae United States. [25-13913] (ECF: Michael Weisbuch) [Entered: 02/24/2026 03:13 PM]
02/27/2026	☐ 29 29 pg, 323.09 KB	Amicus Brief as of right or by consent of the parties filed by Robert Wayne Evans for City of Marco Island, Florida. [25-13913] (ECF: Robert Evans) [Entered: 02/27/2026 03:58 PM]
02/27/2026	☐ 30 1 pg, 137.27 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by Robert Wayne Evans for Amicus Curiae of the Florida Sheriff's Association in support of the City of Marco Island Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: Robert Evans) [Entered: 02/27/2026 04:52 PM]
03/02/2026	☐ 31	Notice of deficient Amicus Brief filed by Robert Wayne Evans for Florida Sheriffs Association. Document filed without leave of the Court. An amicus curiae must file its brief no later than 7 days after the principal brief of the party being supported is filed. See FRAP 29(a)(6). [Entered: 03/02/2026 09:57 AM]
03/03/2026	☐ 32 34 pg, 534.5 KB	<i>MOTION to file amicus brief filed by Robert Wayne Evans - Florida Sheriff's Association and Florida Police Chief's Association. [32]</i> [25-13913] (ECF: Robert Evans) [Entered: 03/03/2026 11:14 AM]
03/03/2026	☐ 33 1 pg, 127.55 KB	APPEARANCE of Counsel Form filed by J. David Marsey for Florida Police Chiefs Association Related cases? No. [25-13913] (ECF: John Marsey) [Entered: 03/03/2026 11:19 AM]
03/04/2026	☐ 34	NOTICE OF CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS (CIP) DEFICIENCY issued to Michael Weisbuch for USA. You have failed to complete the Web-Based CIP on the Court's website. If you are an appellant or petitioner, pursuant to 11th Cir. Rules 26.1-5(c) and 42-1(b), this appeal will be dismissed without further notice upon the expiration of 14 days from the date of this notice unless you remedy the default(s). If you are an appellee or respondent, pursuant to 11th Cir. R. 26.1-5(c), no action may be taken on your filings until you comply with the CIP rules. [Entered: 03/04/2026 09:08 AM]
03/20/2026	☐ 35 11 pg, 417.91 KB	Supplemental Authority filed by Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. [25-13913] (ECF: Amanda Pulido) [Entered: 03/20/2026 08:03 PM]
03/24/2026	☐ 36 8 pg, 271.13 KB	AMENDED Certificate of Interested Persons and Corporate Disclosure Statement filed by Attorney Andreia Trifoi for Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. On the same day the CIP is served, any filer represented by counsel must also complete the court's web-based stock ticker symbol certificate at the link here http://www.ca11.uscourts.gov/web-based-cip or on the court's website. See 11th Cir. R. 26.1-1(b). [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 03/24/2026 05:32 PM]
03/24/2026	☐ 37 34 pg, 268.97 KB	Reply Brief filed by Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 03/24/2026 05:58 PM]
03/25/2026	☐ 38 2 pg, 118.82 KB	NOTICE TO PARTIES: Within seven days of the date of this notice, each party must send to the Court paper copies of the party's brief(s) and appendix, if any, as specified in the attached notice. **Includes Amicus parties; Florida Police Chiefs Association and Florida Sheriff's Association can wait until motion is ruled on to send paper copies** [Entered: 03/25/2026 02:57 PM]

03/27/2026	☐ 39	Received paper copies of Amicus Curiae brief [2 copies] for Amicus Curiae Cato Institute. [Entered: 03/27/2026 03:57 PM]
03/30/2026	☐ 40	Received paper copies of Appellants brief [2 copies] and reply brief, [2 copies] and appendix [2] copies [1] volume for Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. [Entered: 03/30/2026 09:45 AM]
03/30/2026	☐ 41	Received paper copies of Amici Curiae brief [3 copies] for Amici Curiae State of Alabama, State of Alaska, State of Arkansas, State of Georgia, State of Indiana, State of Iowa, State of Kansas, State of Louisiana, State of Missouri, State of Nebraska, State of North Dakota, State of Ohio, State of Pennsylvania, State of South Carolina, State of South Dakota, State of Tennessee, State of Texas, State of Utah and State of West Virginia. [Entered: 03/30/2026 09:55 AM]
04/01/2026	☐ 42	Received paper copies of Appellee brief [2 copies] for Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. [Entered: 04/01/2026 03:28 PM]
04/06/2026	☐ 43 3 pg, 110.91 KB	ORDER: The motion of the Florida Sheriffs Association and Florida Police Chiefs Association for leave to file an amicus brief out of time is GRANTED. [32] RJL (See attached order for complete text) [Entered: 04/06/2026 09:44 AM]
04/06/2026	☐ 44 28 pg, 848.57 KB	Amicus Brief filed by Amici Curiae Florida Police Chiefs Association and Florida Sheriffs Association.. [Entered: 04/06/2026 09:53 AM]
04/06/2026	☐ 45	NOTICE OF CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS (CIP) DEFICIENCY issued to Robert Wayne Evans for Florida Sheriffs Association and John David Marsey for Florida Police Chiefs Association. You have failed to complete the Web-Based CIP on the Court's website. If you are an appellant or petitioner, pursuant to 11th Cir. Rules 26.1-5(c) and 42-1(b), this appeal will be dismissed without further notice upon the expiration of 14 days from the date of this notice unless you remedy the default(s). If you are an appellee or respondent, pursuant to 11th Cir. R. 26.1-5(c), no action may be taken on your filings until you comply with the CIP rules. [Entered: 04/06/2026 09:55 AM]
04/06/2026	☐ 46 2 pg, 118.49 KB	NOTICE TO PARTIES: Within seven days of the date of this notice, each party must send to the Court paper copies of the party's brief(s) and appendix, if any, as specified in the attached notice. [Entered: 04/06/2026 09:57 AM]
04/09/2026	☐ 47	Received paper copies of Amici Curiae [2 copies] for Amici Curiae Florida Police Chiefs Association and Florida Sheriffs Association. [Entered: 04/09/2026 11:16 AM]
07/10/2026	☐ 48 75 pg, 464.59 KB	Supplemental Authority filed by Appellants Stephen Overman, Shannon Schemel and Michael Tschida. [25-13913] (ECF: Andreia Trifoi) [Entered: 07/10/2026 05:10 PM]
07/17/2026	☐ 49 2 pg, 166.11 KB	Response to Supplemental Authority (28J) filed by Appellee City of Marco Island Florida. [25-13913] (ECF: Amanda Pulido) [Entered: 07/17/2026 10:51 AM]